

**PLANNING COMMITTEE**

**Minutes of the Meeting held on 29 June 2017 at 4.30 pm**

**Present:**

Councillor S J Pugsley .....Chairman  
Councillor B Maitland-Walker .....Vice Chairman

Councillor I Aldridge	Councillor A Kingston-James
Councillor S Dowding	Councillor P Murphy
Councillor A Hadley	Councillor J Parbrook
Councillor B Heywood	Councillor K Turner
Councillor I Jones	Councillor T Venner
	Councillor R Woods

**Officers in Attendance:**

Area Planning Manager – Bryn Kitching  
Planning Officer – Sue Keal  
Major Applications Co-Ordinator– John Burton  
Legal Advisor Brian Convery – Shape Partnership Services  
Democratic Services Officer – Tracey Meadows

**P10 Apologies for Absence**

There were apologies from Councillors Goss, Mills and Morgan. Councillor Hadley substituted for Councillor Mills.

**P11 Minutes**

**Resolved** that the Minutes of the Planning Committee Meeting held on the 18 May 2017 circulated at the meeting be confirmed as a correct record.

Proposed by Councillor Pugsley, seconded by Councillor Maitland-Walker

The **motion** was carried.

**P12 Declarations of Interest or Lobbying**

Councillor Parbrook declared that she had been lobbied on application no. 3/21/17/025. Councillor Woods declared that she had been lobbied in favour of application no. 3/26/17/015. She declared that she would keep an open mind. Councillor Venner declared that he had been lobbied on application no. 3/21/17/025, he declared that he had made an independent site visit and would keep an open mind. Councillor Hadley declared that he had been approached by residents at the site meeting for application no. 3/21/17/025, he declared that he had not 'fettered his discretion'.

**P13 Public Participation**

Min No.	Reference No.	Application	Name	Position	Stance
---------	---------------	-------------	------	----------	--------

P14	3/21/17/025	Extension and conversion of 3 No. bed bungalow into a 6 No. bed bungalow as an assisted living unit annexe to Dene Lodge Nursing Home. 19 Dunster Close, Alcombe, Minehead	Mr Padfield Mrs Green Mr Kingston-Lee Mr Luckhurst Mr Sykes-Brown	Neighbour  Neighbour  Applicant	Objecting  Objecting Objecting Objecting Infavour
P14	3/21/17/011	Demolition of dwelling and outbuilding and erection of 3 No dwellings with formation of access (part retention of works already undertaken). The Homestead, Bircham Road, Alcombe, Minehead	Mr Mike Bellamy  Mr Steve Loveday	Highway Consultant acting for Acorn Developments  On behalf of Acorn Developments	Infavour  Infavour
P14	3/21/17/012	Demolition of outbuildings and erection of 4 no dwellings with formation of access (part retention of works already undertaken) as amended. The Homestead, Bircham Road, Alcombe, Minehead	Mr Vickery Mrs Tucker Mr Mike Bellamy  Mr Steve Loveday	Neighbour  Neighbour Highway Consultant acting for Acorn Developments  On behalf of Acorn Developments	Objecting  Objecting Infavour  Infavour
P14	3/24/17/001	Additional use of part of orchard as camping and glamping site (during the period March-October) together with the erection of a shower block and formation of an access track (revised description). Torre Cider Farm, Washford, Old Cleeve, Minehead	Mr Steve Allonby  Vicky Roe-Mottershead  Clifton Jones  Gemma Combe  Mr Nigel Furze	Neighbour  Neighbour Neighbour Applicant  Planning Agent	Objecting  Objecting Objecting Infavour  Infavour
P14	3/28/16/008	Demolition of garden structures and erection of 1	Mrs Swan	Sampford Brett Parish Council	Objecting

		no. dwelling and detached garage with formation of vehicular and pedestrian accesses. Land to the rear of Brownwich House, Williton			
P14	3/26/17/015	Erection of porch to front elevation (amended scheme to 3/26/17/009). The Sanctuary, 55 Cleeve park, Chapel Cleeve, Old Cleeve, Minehead	Mrs Margaret Smith  Dr Penny Rawson	Neighbour  Applicant	Objecting  Infavour

#### **P14 Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and Other Matters**

Report two of the Planning Team dated 21 June 2017 (circulated with the Agenda). The Committee considered the reports, prepared by the Planning Team, relating to plans deposited in accordance with the planning legislation and, where appropriate, Members were advised of correspondence received and subsequent amendments since the agenda had been prepared.

(Copies of all letters reported may be inspected in the planning application files that constitute part of the background papers for each item).

**RESOLVED** That the Recommendations contained in Section 1 of the Report be Approved (in so far as they relate to the above), including, where appropriate, the conditions imposed and the reasons for refusal, subject to any amendments detailed below:

#### **Reference      Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/21/17/025 – Extension and conversion of 3 No. bed bungalow into a 6 No. bed bungalow as an assisted living unit annexe to Dene Lodge Nursing Home. 19 Dunster Close, Alcombe, Minehead**

#### **Comments by members of the public;**

- Over development of the site;
- Site is within 3 metres of the main sewer;
- Out of character with the other houses in the street;
- Insufficient turning space for delivery/waste lorries/ Fire Engines;
- Parking inadequate for staff and visitors;
- Residential area not suitable for this type of business;
- This development would destroy the equilibrium of Dunster Close and erode the community;
- Concerns about the party wall and adjacent garage;
- There was a Covenant on the properties stating that the houses were not to be used for business purposes;
- TPO on trees in garden;

- New plans submitted, residents did not have the opportunity to see beforehand;

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- Insufficient parking in the street for staff and residents resulting in displacement parking;
- Inadequate turning provision for construction and larger vehicles as the road was only 3 metres wide;
- No plans included for the charging spaces for disabled vehicles;
- New plans show access to Dunster Close closed off by natural screening of a Laurel hedge therefore shutting the property away from Dunster Close;
- This development fills an important need in the community;
- There will be extra movement by vehicles to the residence by Doctors/Nurses visiting the residents;
- Due to the size of the garden this development was not considered over development of the site;
- Most of the worries to residents had been resolved in the newly submitted plans;

Councillor Turner proposed and Councillor Heywood seconded a motion that the application be **Approved** with amended conditions that; Condition 7. Prior to the construction of the assisted unit, the existing access to the site from Dunster Close shall be stopped up as shown on the submitted Block Plan, drawing no. 2017-1 and retained in this manner at all times hereafter, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the LPA. Condition 9. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (or any order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification), there shall be no pedestrian access created from the site to Dunster Close. Condition 10. Prior to occupation of the unit no works shall be undertaken on site unless a hard and soft landscape scheme has been first submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such a scheme shall include details of all walls, fences, trees, hedgerows and other planting which are to be retained plus details of all new walls, fences and other boundary treatment and finished ground levels, a planting specification to include numbers, density, size, species and positions of all new trees and shrubs and the location of grassed areas and areas for shrub planting plus details of the hard surface treatment such as terraces or patios of the open parts of the site; and a programme of implementation.

The **motion** was carried

**Reference Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/21/17/011 – Demolition of dwelling and outbuilding and erection of 3 No. dwellings with formation of access (part retention of works already undertaken). The Homestead, Bircham Road, Alcombe, Minehead**

**Comments by member of the public;**

- New access proposals were considered to be acceptable;
- Waste and recycling would be collected by the kerbside as with other properties in the area;
- Highways had not raised any objections to this application;

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- Disappointed that the applicant had started work on the site without prior planning permission putting the committee in a invidious situation to pass the application;
- The site could take three dwellings;
- This development was making good use of the site;
- The development was not out of keeping with other properties in the area;

Councillor Turner proposed and Councillor Hadley seconded a **motion** that the application be **Approved**

The **motion** was carried

**Reference Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/21/17/012 – Demolition of outbuildings and erection of 4 No. dwellings with formation of access) part retention of works already undertaken) as amended. The Homestead, Bircham Road, Alcombe, Minehead**

**Comments by member of the public;**

- Overlooking;
- Pedestrian safety;
- Loss of privacy and peace and quiet;
- Not in keeping with neighbouring bungalows in the area;
- No official turning places on the estate;
- All properties in the Shires are bungalows there are no houses;
- This is an open plan site with no protection for children or animals;
- Only 20 inches in this small road for a pavement;
- During certain times of the day you are not allowed to park outside of your own property;
- There would be ample car parking and turning for all four bungalows on the site;
- Development would be served by a block paved shared surface;
- Highways had not raised any objections to this application;

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- Concerns with the access to the site;
- Large vehicles with have problems accessing this site;
- Development not in keeping with the area;
- Overlooking;
- Four properties on this site was not overdevelopment;
- Swept path analysis was too tight for Waste vehicles;

Councillor Turner proposed and Councillor Parbrook seconded a motion to **REFUSE** the application. The motion **FAILED**

Councillor Aldridge proposed and Councillor Heywood seconded a motion to **APPROVE** the application with additional conditions for the deletion of the gable end window in plot 15, Bin storage, Surface water and a Legal Agreement to secure community infrastructure contributions.

The **Motion** was carried

**Reference Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/24/17/001– Additional use of part of orchard as a camping and glamping site (during the period March-October) together with the erection of a shower block and formation of an access track (REVISED DESCRIPTION). Torre Cider Farm, Washford, Old Cleeve, Watchet**

**Comments by members of the public;**

- Concerns with noise nuisance from Stag and Hen parties, BBQ's into the night and parties;
- Size of groups should be limited;
- Damage to footpaths;
- Opening hours of the shop;
- Dangerous road for pedestrians and cyclists;
- Adverse impact on residents amenities;
- Removal of trees on the site;
- Good for the community and surrounding areas;
- There would not be any noise impact on neighbours;
- Traffic would not be increased;
- Noise would be controlled;
- Tourism was a key economic driver in West Somerset;

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- Site would be good for the economy;
- There would be no significant noise increase;
- Cutting of trees was not a planning issue;
- This was a small farm that had diversified;
- Torre sign to low, obscured view from the road;

Councillor Aldridge proposed and Councillor Turner seconded a motion that the application be **APPROVED**

The **Motion** was carried

**Reference Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/28/16/008 – Demolition of garden structures and erection of 1 No. dwelling and detached garage with formation of vehicular and pedestrian accesses. Land to the rear of Brownich House, 47 Tower hill, Williton**

**Comments by member of the public;**

- Primary concerns is pedestrians using the public footpath safely;
- Previous application for one house only;

- Construction traffic would damage the footpath;

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- This is back land development and would open the flood gates for further development if granted;
- Damage to neighbours Beech tree;
- Ownership of the track was in dispute;
- Flooding;
- No mains sewer;
- Premature application;
- Neighbours Human Rights do not seem to have been considered at all;
- Out of keeping with existing dwellings in the area;
- There should not be any more vehicular movement using the footpath;

Councillor Dowding proposed and Councillor Woods seconded a motion that the application be **REFUSED**

**Reason**

The track to be used as the access to the proposed dwelling is narrow and has little use by vehicular traffic. It is also a public right of way and has significant use by walkers. The proposed erection of a dwelling would result in an increase in the use of the track by motor vehicles which would have very limited ability to pass and also increase the potential for conflict between pedestrians on vehicles. This would result in there not being a safe and easy pedestrian access to local facilities as well as inconveniencing walkers using the public right of way from accessing the countryside. Therefore the proposal is contrary to the provisions of Policies SC1 and NH13 of the West Somerset Local Plan to 2032.

The **Motion** was carried

**Reference Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/26/17/015 – Erection of porch to front elevation (amended scheme to 3/26/17/009). The Sanctuary, 55 Cleeve Park, chapel Cleeve, Old Cleeve, Minehead**

**Comments by members of the public;**

- Over development of the site;
- Against Article 4 relating to Cleeve Park as Chapel Cleeve was not a village statue;
- Would be totally out of character by the scale and appearance;
- The porch would enhance the Chalet merging it in with the existing look;
- Consideration should be made that times have moved on since the park was developed 50 years ago;
- Matching materials cannot be sought due to manufactures not making the original materials anymore;

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- Expansion by stealth;
- Contrary to Policy BD3;
- A smaller porch would be reasonable to accept this proposal;

Councillor Turner proposed and Councillor Murphy seconded a motion that the application be **REFUSED**

**Reason**

The existing site is constrained under an existing Article 4 direction and is in a Special Landscape Area. The proposal in combination with the already approved rear extension would significantly enlarge this chalet by 74.6% thereby unacceptably increasing its scale and impact within its rural woodland setting and eroding the established character and amenity of the area. The proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to the provision of policy BD/3 of the West Somerset District Local Plan 2006.

The **Motion** was carried

**P15 Exmoor National Park Matters**

Councillor B Heywood reported on matters relating to West Somerset considered at the meeting on 6 June 2017 of the Exmoor National Park Planning Committee. This included:

No appeals lodged and one decision

**P15 Delegated Decision List (replies from Officers are in italic)**

No observations on the Delegated Decision list.

**P16 Appeals Lodged**

Appeal against the refusal of the erection of a first floor extension over the garage and carport to be used as an annex at The Outback, 9A Reed Close, Watchet, TA23 0EE (planning application 3/37/17/001)

Appeal against the refusal of the erection of a first floor extension over the garage and carport to be used as an annex (resubmission of 3/37/17/001) at The Outback, 9A Reed Close, Watchet, TA23 0EE (planning application 3/37/17/012)

**P17 Appeals Decided**

No appeals decided

The meeting closed at 9.17pm

DRAFT